

Education and Assimilation of the Indigenous in the Novels *Mariluán* and *Aves sin nido*

PABLO HURTADO RUIZ

pablo.hurtado@usach.cl

Universidad de Santiago de Chile

ORCID ROR

ABSTRACT: This paper analyzes the education of the indigenous in the novels *Mariluán* (1862) by Alberto Blest Gana and *Aves sin nido* (1889) by Clorinda Matto de Turner. Both works raise the problem of the indigenous for the national project and the difficulties that education entails. By reviewing the educational strategies in the works, the relationship between the novel and the civilizing process pursued by the authors is established. Both works show the failure of the attempts to civilize the indigenous world, determined by different actors that function as obstacles to the development of societies.

KEYWORDS: Education; Indigenous peoples; State; Nations; Civilization.

Educación y asimilación del indígena en las novelas *Mariluán* y *Aves sin nido*

RESUMEN: El presente artículo analiza la educación del indígena en las novelas *Mariluán* (1862) de Alberto Blest Gana y *Aves sin nido* (1889) de Clorinda Matto de Turner. Ambas obras plantean el problema del indígena para el proyecto nacional y de las dificultades que la educación conlleva. Mediante la revisión de las estrategias educativas en el enunciado de las obras se establece la relación entre la novela y el proceso civilizatorio que persiguen los autores. Ambas obras evidencian el fracaso de los intentos por civilizar el mundo indígena, determinado por distintos actores que funcionan como obstáculos para el desarrollo de las sociedades.

PALABRAS CLAVE: Educación; población indígena; Estado, nación; civilización.

TRANSLATION OF SUMMARY: Pablo Hurtado Ruiz / Universidad de Santiago de Chile

HOW TO QUOTE

Hurtado, P. (2024). Education and Assimilation of the Indigenous in the Novels *Mariluán* and *Aves sin nido*. *Culturales*, 12, e774. <https://doi.org/10.22234/recu.20241201.e774>

RECEIVED June 1, 2023 / APPROVED October 6, 2023 / PUBLISHED January 17, 2024



Introduction

During the period of consolidation and modernization of the national states, the scriptural form of the novel was understood as one of the propitious instruments for education. In the attempt to homogenize societies that were by nature variegated in order to build a modern nation, the novel was understood as a platform for the formation of cultural ideas and, at the same time, it contributed to the development of progress and civilization of society. Thus, if the main concerns of the nation and its writers are discussed in the form of novels, the problem of education will be one of the fundamental themes that will run through a large part of nineteenth-century literature, that is, the way in which it is sought and needed to educate the popular sectors as a basis for the homogenization of the national population and the entry of Latin American societies into what were considered the higher stages of civilization.

In this way, the novels will discuss the ways in which otherness must be subsumed in the modern nation-state, whether this otherness is part of the popular or indigenous sectors, who are marginalized from the idea of cultural development defended at the time. In the Andean world, the indigenous and their cultural differences emerge as a group that must be (re)educated in order to be included within the nation. Although they are understood as alien to the popular sectors, they will be part of the same response as the poorer population. During the second half of the nineteenth century, the educated distinguish in the indigenous a certain socio-racial group that is trapped in the lower stages of civilization, therefore, it is not rare that together with the description of the indigenous territories one finds the reading of an enlightenment utopia that establishes the need to educate as a way to bring to the present urban civilized rural society.

When considering the corpus of the so-called nineteenth-century national novel, we find a series of writings that from the point of view of indianism or indigenism will form part of the discussion regarding the homogeneity and inclusion of the subject of alterity in the proposed national unity. In the texts whose central problem is the inclusion of the indigenous, the organization of the new societies is necessarily imbricated with the need for their education. As part of this corpus, both *Mariluán* ([1862]1949) by Alberto Blest

Gana and *Aves sin nido* ([1889]1994) by Clorinda Matto de Turner, review from different perspectives and conditions the entry of the Indian into Chilean and Peruvian societies, respectively. In the case of *Blest Gana*, it is found during a heated period of discussion regarding the inclusion of Araucania into the nation-state and the expansion of popular education, while Clorinda Matto is found in the post-war period, when different Peruvian intellectuals seek the reasons for the defeat by Chile and the failure of the national unity proposed by the State.

Both novels will construct a space disconnected from the national centers that prevents the homogenization of society. The protagonists must cross a frontier behind which civilization cannot enter for different reasons. This is the task of Fermín Mariluán and this is the quest of the Marín couple: the civilization of the indigenous and their space. Although they fail in their task, the civilizing work has as a presupposition the entry of the school into the spaces in which it has been denied, so that education turns out to be a transversal solution in both novels. The reasons for failure have to do with obstacles to the entry of civilization and therefore of the State's educational project in uncontrolled territories.

The works in question understand education as a method for overcoming the uncivilized and the inclusion of the indigenous within the State in the process of modernization. However, the belief that education alone will suffice to bring the indigenous people to the higher stages of civilization is questioned. Under this, the novels are literate conjurings about the Indian who must be the subject of a new conquest, no longer (only) military, but also educational. They are part of a literate thinking that constructs an ideal subject to be educated and its counterpart, a character-obstacle for the inclusion of the Indian within the spaces of national culture.

Prior to the analysis, we must recognize that there are elements common to both novels. Both construct an evident frontier between civilized spaces and spaces of barbarism. This frontier is crossed by the subjects who try to change the conditions in which that territory is inhabited to another one that is anchored in the past, whether indigenous or colonial; however, the attempt to change the norms entails failure and the

sanction of the reformer, in *Aves sin nido* it is the expulsion of the Marín couple and in *Mariluán* the murder and decapitation of the protagonist; through actions that include the presence of education -which functions as a promoter of civilization- an attempt is made to overturn the rules of a space that is not prepared, that is anchored in its immobilism and in the logics of the past.

On the other hand, we consider that both works evidence a project of national organization that comes from a certain social class, they sustain the idea of national homogeneity even though they show differences that we will point out later. These national narratives will hide the differences inherent to Latin American societies. Behind the writings on the world occupied by the indigenous people, the very structure of the colonial period assumed by the Creoles is manifested:

The ideals of social homogenization, state centralism and cultural uniformity that were considered requirements to achieve the purposes of order and progress around the figure of the citizen clash from the beginning against an irreducible heterogeneity that threatened to subvert the values and principles of enlightenment rationality (Moraña, 2014, p. 54).

It should be noted that, despite this homogenizing attempt, indigenous subjects continue to have a presence within the spaces of national construction, arrogating them through symbolic, political and cultural strategies of resistance that “always refer to the past” (Moraña, 2014, p. 74); however, these voices and strategies rarely have a place as authors or as readers of the novels produced.

Another decisive element with respect to national formation is the high rate of illiteracy in societies. For example, in the Chilean case, in 1813, the illiterate population probably reached 90%. According to the data provided by the censuses of the time, in 1865 it reached 83.3% and in 1907 60%. In other words, despite the advances in school and education, the discussions that took place within the literate world were of a white and mainly urban sector of the population, a situation that was known and defended by the intellectuals of the time.

In other words, in these narratives we find the voice of literate whites speaking to their own social group. The illiterate population -mainly the urban, rural and indigenous popular sectors - was excluded from the political processes of the country and, of course, was not considered as an objective reader of the novels. Thus, the representations of the other have as their target reader the literate group itself, especially the urban one, so it is a useless exercise to try to understand how valid this representation was for the indigenous, since they are manifestations of the imaginary regarding the subaltern groups and the way in which they should be included within the nation-state that was being consolidated.

Literature and education; progress and civilization

By analyzing the authors' visions of literature and, in particular, of the novel, it is possible to demonstrate the responsibilities they gave to the written space within the promotion and development of the nation. Alfonso Reyes defined the literature of the period as ancillary, that is, a work in which "literary expression serves as a vehicle for a non-literary content and purpose" (Reyes, 1980, p. 40). In this sense, literary ancillarity leads to sustain the intertwined composition of the different writings of the period, including literary, historiographic, ethnographic and political expressions, among others. However, we argue that such ancillarity is a founding component of the national novel, which, while constructing a literary work, is at the service of the formation of societies. It is not unusual for the literature of the period to deal with the main problems that constitute the process of national formation and thus point, among other things, to the questions surrounding education.

In this process, the writers we analyze, mainly Blest Gana (1977, p. 115), will understand the novel as part of the pedagogical apparatus for the large population, or as a possibility for the education of society. In his acceptance speech at the University of Chile, he points out that national literature is subject to "the same vicissitudes of [the] political and social existence" of nations, so that writing will have as its mission to serve "the cause of progress":

Therefore, letters must be scrupulous in their civilizing task and strive to clothe in their seductive finery the truths that can bear fruit for the benefit of mankind. By assuming this lofty mission, our literature will fulfill the duty that its nature imposes on it and will render true services to the cause of progress (Blest, 1977, p. 117).

The civilizing sense of writing will find in the novel form the main ally to carry out the modernizing and progressive pedagogical project that Blest Gana gives to literature. The novel is preferable to poetry, which had been cultivated by other writers because of the possibilities that narrative could open up:

While poetry always retains for the vulgar the appearance of ancient idols whose language was understandable only to the priests of pagan worship, the novel, on the contrary, has a special charm for all kinds of intelligences, speaks the language of all, paints pictures that everyone can understand and apply in their own way and brings civilization to the less educated classes of society, by the appeal of scenes of ordinary life told in an easy and simple language. Its popularity, therefore, can be immense, its usefulness unquestionable, its means of action very diverse and the field of its inspirations very extensive (Blest, 1977, p. 120).

The novel is seen as a pedagogical instrument for the development and progress of the people, mainly of “the less educated classes of society” due to its possibilities of being read by the entire population. For her part, Clorinda Matto expresses the need for a realistic novel that deals with national problems. From the pages of the newspaper *El Perú Ilustrado* she pointed out in 1890: “The mission of the novel is to correct with red-hot iron while delighting with the fruitions of chaste love and with the aroma of violets hidden among the leaves of the volume” (quoted in Portugal, n.d.). It complements the idea expressed in the prologue of *Aves sin nido*, where it is pointed out that the function of the novel is “to be the photograph that stereotypes the vices and virtues of a people, with the consequent corrective moral for the former and the homage of admiration for the latter” (Matto de

Turner, 1994, p. 3).¹ This literary mode, therefore, also functions as a pedagogical strategy that allows evidence and proposes correctives for social problems. In the words of Clorinda Matto: “In countries where, like ours, *literature* is in its cradle, the novel has to exert greater influence in the morigeration of customs” (p. 3, italics in the original).

Although, as Benedict Anderson (2016) states, the novel and the newspaper “provided the technical means necessary for the ‘representation’ of the kind of imagined community that was the nation” (Anderson, 2016, p. 47), in the mid-nineteenth century the ruling elites considered these media as instruments that contribute to the education of the popular classes, however, the pillar of the construction of the imagined society will be the school. It is worth to mention, literate culture finds in the school the possibility of expanding the spaces of development and modernization of societies, so that writings - including literature- contribute to education and do not constitute the main technical means that will forge the national identity.

The novels were not only in themselves builders of a national identity and pedagogical instruments, but also accompany and discuss the problem of the formation of the popular sectors, they are part of the argumentation built mainly by the liberal sectors to work on the problem of the need to expand the public school and to cover with state education the spaces neglected by the State during the first years of the nascent republics. *Mariluán* is written in the midst of the educational debates surrounding the training of the popular sectors and the need to create a single, centralized system of education: “The school was established in the Araucanía area along with the incipient development of the urban world, as in the rest of the country, trying to incorporate the popular sectors and the rural world, which almost only by accident, from the perspective of the public school, was also indigenous” (Serrano, 1995-1996, p. 424). *Aves sin nido*, on the other hand, is part of a long discussion on the need for education of the indigenous,² a discussion that will be

¹ According to Lola Aponte Ramos, *Aves sin nido* follows the logic of indigenist novels, where the problem of the novel and its role in society is usually discussed. Clorinda Matto “dedicates the ‘Proemio’ to answer several questions about the ars poetica of the genre she is working on. Moreover, the Peruvian writer alludes to such questions indirectly in the very process of narration, in such a way that this is a text that offers theory and practice of writing” (Aponte, 1994, p. 45).

² The issue of education will be discussed in much of the indigenist discourse until well into the twentieth century. In this regard, recall, for example, that in *El mundo es ancho y ajeno* [1941] by Ciro Alegría, the great

embodied since the end of the War of the Pacific and that Clorinda Matto herself will give voice to in her work.

As a utopian narrative, the nation-state presupposes the existence of a European, civilized and centrally cohesive society, so that, in its narratives, the form of inclusion establishes a dissolution of the indigenous Other by Western-white-European hegemony, according to the classification proposed by Fernando Coronil (1999). This means that “Western and non-Western cultures oppose each other as radically different entities, and their opposition is resolved through the absorption of non-Western peoples into a victorious and expanding West” (Coronil, 1999, p. 28). Further on he insists: “In this mode of representation, America is nothing more than the territorial stage for the expansion of the West, and its diverse cultures are the object to be absorbed” (Coronil, 1999, p. 30).

This idea is in line with the process of social whitening through which the different cultural manifestations existing in the variegated Latin American societies are hidden under the mask of homogeneity. According to Mara Viveros (2016, p. 18): “The ideological dimension of social whitening has been constructed in relation to a national identity that privileges the white, or what is close to it, and restricts the social and symbolic space occupied by indigenous and Afro-descendant populations”. In other words, homogeneity erases cultural differences and restricts the sense of nation to the hegemonic ideology that, during the periods of organization of national states, corresponds to Eurocentric modes of understanding.

With this in mind, the American novels take on the problem of education and the modernization of the nation at a time when the indigenous becomes a political and economic problem. In the case of *Blest Gana*, the space of the economic crisis and the voices raised for the definitive occupation of the Araucanía that, in 1861, with the election of Cornelio Saavedra as intendant, begins its definitive process (Bengoa, 2008, pp. 170 ff.). In the case of *Clorinda Matto*, the post-Pacific War and the economic crisis and the breakdown of the national narrative that it entailed.

unfinished project of Rosendo Maqui was to install a school in the Rumi community so that in the future its inhabitants would be able to fend for themselves through the knowledge of writing.

From the enlightenment viewpoint of the founding discourses of the Latin American republics, extended during the 19th century and a good part of the 20th century, education was seen as the instrument to overcome the problems of morality and cleanliness existing in the popular classes that began to settle in the cities and in the sectors outside the urban space. The education of the popular sectors meant the overcoming of the problems of the “backwardness” of the American societies, at the same time that they were closer to the higher states of civilization. It is understood that the development of humanity is unique, linear and staggered, so that societies should tend towards civilization which, in other words, implies the Europeanization of the continent.³ From this position, the popular and indigenous sectors are linked and meet in the concern of the elites to include them in the modernization of the State.

The concern for education manifested in state educational action was largely related to the civilization and moralization of the people, an important element of the modernizing process implemented by the dominant elites. Increasing levels of education was perceived as a condition for modernization and a requirement for entering international trade circuits (Egaña, 2000, p. 13).

The ruling elites found in education a way to ward off the danger posed by the excluded subjects of national societies: “The masses of the excluded quickly became a danger and education could become an instrument of order and social integration” (Egaña, 2000, p. 13); however, the positions regarding the role of the State in relation to popular education were not uniform, which is evident in the long discussion that concluded with the approval of the Law of Primary Education of 1860 in Chile.

From the educationalist positions, the civilizing and custom-forming character that this education should have will be emphasized, hence the importance of the massification of popular primary education for the development of society as a whole. The responsibility of the State, in this context, was an issue of crucial importance, which generated controversy and was finally decided in following the most liberal positions that favored a decisive state

³ “The different historical discourses (evangelization, civilization, the white man’s burden, modernization, development, globalization) all have as their underpinning the conception that there is a civilizational pattern that is simultaneously superior and normal” (Lander, 2016, p. 29).

intervention. The institutionalization of this education in 1860 enshrined liberal principles of free education and state responsibility, together with a centralized organization of the system and state control of pedagogical activity (Egaña, 2000, p. 60).

The institutionalization of education brings with it the question of the inclusion of subjects who are behind the borders within the same country. In Chile, in the mid-19th century, the *Mapuches* enjoyed autonomy from the Chilean State, while in post-war Peru, the abandonment of the indigenous people -and the highlands in general- was denounced, so that the educational problem was mainly a problem of national integration and the search for the homogenization of the territory.

The school institution, therefore, functions as the integrating axis of the nation-state, which seeks to modernize itself through the inclusion of the "others", those who remain on the margins of the consolidation of society and who are created by this same unification of the imagined community: "The 'other' is an unfortunate construction, which from the very center of its enunciative *locus* rarefies the difference as such. Power must fabricate 'othernesses' because by crushing them it strengthens and legitimizes itself" (González, 1996, p. 40). Following this idea, the concern for otherness and its construction seeks in the national states the inclusion and assimilation of the spaces of difference as a form of development, of ascent in the civilizing scale.

In the case of indigenous education, during the formation of national states, there was constant cooperation between Church and State to integrate the territories into the national society. In spite of the Church's resistance to education being the exclusive responsibility of the State, during the first years of independent life and prior to the occupation of Araucanía, the pedagogical work with the indigenous people continued to be, to a large extent, exclusively missionary (Serrano, 1995-1996).

***Mariluán* and civilization**

As we pointed out, in the novels to be studied we find a series of disputes regarding the indigenous territory to be assimilated. A frontier is established that divides the civilized world from the barbarism represented by that other space that exceeds the limits of state

control. Thus, in both works, the responsibility for barbarism falls on some subjects of that world, either the indigenous themselves (*Mariluán*) or the conservative non-Indian subjects (*Aves sin nido*).

We cannot lose sight of the fact that the representations of the indigenous and of their world are, in both novels, writing exercises of authors from the capital. That is, they represent the image that literate positions are held in urban spaces that see in the indigenous space a territory that must be included within the limits of the State. Therefore, the enlightened idea of order as a space for the constitution of civility leads to consider cities as places where nature, both human and spatial, has been tamed, while that other side of the border, the indigenous space itself - the *Buthalmapu*⁴ and the *Killac* - are spaces of overflowing disorder. There is a dichotomous organization of the world that is subsumed in civilization and barbarism: order/disorder; progress/stagnation, among others.

In *Mariluán* by Alberto Blest Gana, the formation of the citizen is constructed from different institutions, mainly the school and the army. The protagonist of the novel is taken hostage by his father in Tapihue in 1825 to be educated at the *Liceo de Chile* and then assigned to military service. Fermín Mariluán is educated in the two institutions mentioned above. In this way, school and army are fundamental for the inclusion of the other in the space of the national reality because during the 19th century and a good part of the 20th century they function as a structure of disciplining the popular bodies.

It has been constantly thought that Mariluán, Caleu and Peuquilen represent the three degrees of civilization of the *Mapuche*, so it is necessary to see the conditions in which each of the characters is constructed. In principle, *Mariluán's* education is complete: school and army function as the disciplining of the body's drives and the entrance to a superior, civilized condition of society: "As a pledge of loyalty, Mariluán gave his son Fermín as hostage, who was educated at the Liceo de Chile and later destined for military service" (Blest, 1949, p. 99). Nevertheless, the education of Fermín Mariluán could not undo the formation received during his childhood:

⁴ We use *Buthalmapu* over *Wallmapu* because it is the way in which the region is named in Blest Gana's work.

But neither the benefits of education, *nor the contact with civilized people who taught him cultural habits very different* from those contracted in his childhood, could ever erase from Fermín Mariluán's soul that instinctive love for the homeland, which in the Araucanian race has produced the high deeds celebrated in the epic (Blest, 1949, p. 99, my italics).

Therefore, although the protagonist is spoken of as "civilized and elegant" (Blest, 1949, p. 104), his interiority cannot be 'chileanized'. That is, no matter how hard one tries to extract the barbarism from the individual, it cannot be accomplished as long as education does not penetrate his native soil. As a whole, we see in *Mariluán* the failure, with only these lines, of the educational strategy that considered taking the indigenous children to Santiago to educate them so that they could have contact with civilized people. With this, a first step is taken in the criticism of the impossibility of their functioning as civilizing agents.

In contrast to the discourse delivered by the novel's narrator, it is understood that the centralized education that Mariluán receives in Santiago does not succeed in eliminating his roots, even when he learns of his *Mapuche* condition through *La Araucana*: "The poem of Don Alonso de Ercilla awakened in the soul of this Indian, polished by civilization, that pride that persecuted races cultivate as a saving religion" (Blest, 1949, p. 100). He cannot be considered a completely westernized subject since he maintains the ideas and vices of the indigenous peoples, for example, "the fatalism typical of primitive races" (Blest, 1949, p. 144).

Antonio Caleu, Mariluán's assistant, had been kidnapped when he was young in a *maloca* made by the army:

Antonio, taken away at a very young age by the Chileans from the arms of his family, in one of those frequent raids made to the Araucanian territory by the frontier army, had since served as a bugler in the *Mariluán* regiment. The rigors of military discipline had not been sufficient to destroy in the heart of that Indian the instinct of independence transmitted from generation to generation by those who put the courage of the Spanish conquistadors at bay (Blest, 1949, p. 104).

Caleu does not have a complete state instruction, but is only limited to life in the army. He visualizes the inadequacy of military training to include the indigenous sectors within the national project. The disciplining of the corps is part of a larger instruction, but in no case is it exclusive or sufficient for the complete formation of the indigenous.

In the first meeting they have, he is presented as Mariluán's counterpart: "The two Indians looked at each other silently for a few moments. The one civilized and elegant, the other coarse and almost savage" (Blest, 1949, p. 104). As a way of further evidencing this difference, the less civilized character speaks of himself using the third person, while Mariluán uses the first person: "-Caleu thinks a lot about his parents and does not know if they are dead. He was on his way to see them and left because here they do not give him a license / You will go when I allow it - Mariluán told him" (Blest, 1949, p. 105). Caleu remains in between civilization and savagery, preserving the qualities attributed to marginalized groups: "Caleu, less civilized than his chief, preserved more intact the suspicious spirit of the savage races" (Blest, 1949, p. 108).

Finally, the case of Peuquilén as the subject who is at the lowest stage of civilization, the one who never left the Buthalmapu and therefore has not been subdued by the education of either the school or the army:

Peuquilén was a really big, strong young man of twenty-eight to thirty years of age, short and stout, in whose eyes shone a somber fire. Among those brave men, Peuquilén had been noted for his reckless daring: far from discrediting him in the eyes of the Indians, they endowed him with a certain prestige, which increases his worth among the savages because of the abuses that a man is capable of committing with brute force (Blest, 1949, p. 164).

The savagery and unregulated warfare practiced by the indigenous people lead him to be considered an essential part of the *Mapuche* people. Peuquilén is described as an animal, incapable of feeling and understanding the reality around him: "Peuquilén was a lion, who, to cool his head, shook his mane in the air and roared, and with violent impatience he would dig the ground, which he thought he felt inflamed because his plant communicated the heat" (Blest, 1949, p. 185). Without understanding the civilized aspects

of war or the natural sciences, Peuquilén's savagery makes him the perfect instrument to repress and defeat Mariluán's ideas.

For Amado Lásca, this bestiality responds to the author's project: "Peuquilén is undoubtedly poorly designed. But it is precisely this deformation that makes the author's ideology regarding the Other emerge more clearly" (Lásca, 2003, p. 18). In this way, in contrast to the image of the good savage, the character represents the dangers that society risks with indigenous people who are alien to metropolitan education and civilization; however, we consider that this is not a deformation of the Other, but rather the construction of a character who, from the capital's perspective, has not had any civilized training, who never left Buthalmapu, did not attend school and did not serve in the army. Peuquilén has not received any kind of instruction or education and, therefore, his construction is that of a character representative of the savage, who is constructed as alien to the basic experiences of humanity, among them, love (Blest, 1949, p. 184).

In the analysis of the representative characters, it is evident that Fermín Mariluán's crossing of the frontier is that of a literate subject who wants to bring civilization to the Buthalmapu. Mariluán would be the perfect wedge by means of which it is intended to include the natives in the rules of the State, he is the representation of the educational discourse that understood that the educated natives would be the main responsible for the inclusion of the Buthalmapu within the Chilean State.

However, Mariluán's proposal to bring civilization to the *Buthalmapu* entails an acculturation process within the society he claims to defend: "His struggle was aimed at integrating the *Mapuche* people into Chilean society with equal rights, but abiding by Chilean jurisdiction and all Chilean institutions. What he ultimately fights against is the oppression of one people over the other, but he does not defend a culture, he defends individuals" (Troncoso, 2003, p. 68). Thus, the inclusion of the indigenous in the nation will only be possible with the suppression of savage traits through a Europeanized education.

This westernization implies the emergence of a new relationship between indigenous people and Chileans that, in the novel, fails miserably: "Peuquilén carries the barbarism that would ratify the idea that the natives themselves are the greatest enemies

of themselves when they resist being acculturated. Peuquilén truncates Mariluán's project in an act that in the text acquires a symbolic meaning: he cuts off the leader's head and with it his ideas of regeneration" (Troncoso, 2003, p. 66). However, Mariluán's death does not mean the end of the Mapuche acculturation project, but rather the end of an educational strategy that in Blest Gana's time was already quite questioned: the extraction of a few individuals who would return to their land to civilize it. In other words, the indigenous could not be brought to civilization as long as they were not grouped in urban spaces that would allow the attendance of the Indians to schools and the mestization of societies.

The civilizing integration of the *Mapuche* in Chilean society masks the subjugation of the other to the hegemonic culture, denying him his own identity, in other words, the subjugation of the Mapuche "makes the rule of exclusion prevail over all those who are partially accepted as different in the disciplinary circle of a society or a Nation" (Barraza, 2013, p. 214), the inclusion of the indigenous will be possible only through his acculturation and his assumption of the European culture. The ultimate goal of education and consequent civilization of the *Mapuche* people will be achieved only from the collective and not from individuals who are uprooted from the territory, education presupposes the grouping of otherness in spaces where the civilized enters automatically.

Thus, the failure of Mariluán, harshly highlighted by almost all critics, cause it does not achieve any of its purposes,⁵ has been understood as the consequent failure of the peaceful inclusion of the Mapuche, or else, of the inevitable violent assimilation to the State:

The violent ending of the novel, with the procession and public exhibition of the head of a figure whose merits allowed us to intuit the viability of such a project, rejects it. Thus, although its narrative complicity with the national policy of indigenous extermination is not direct, one can see in the narrative a history that declares such assimilation unfeasible (Kaempfer, 2006, p. 99).

⁵ "The fascinating hero, for his part, fails doubly. He neither unites forever with Rosa Tudela nor achieves the regeneration of his people" (Triviños, 2006, p. 57).

However, we understand that this failure also corresponds to an educational strategy that assumed that a few enlightened subjects would be able to become civilizing agents of the indigenous territory.

***Aves sin nido*: salvation and immobilism**

In different opportunities it has been emphasized the importance that Manuel González Prada had in the narrative and ideological turn that Clorinda Matto de Turner would have had between her first works and the writing of *Aves sin nido*. It is recalled that the author was present at the reading of the "Speech at the Politeama" of 1888, where González Prada analyzes the role of the Indian and lacks his consideration by the Peruvian elites, which would have meant the defeat in the war against Chile: "With the armies of disciplined Indians and without freedom, Peru will always go to defeat. If we made a servant of the Indian, what homeland will he defend" (González, 1985, p. 44).

For González Prada, the Indian forms the basis of the true national identity: "The true Peru is not formed by the groups of Creoles and foreigners that inhabit the strip of land located between the Pacific and the Andes; the nation is formed by the multitudes of Indians scattered on the eastern side of the mountain range" (González, 1985, p. 45). The space of the nation is found in the Indians. In the Peruvian conflict that has been going on since colonial times, in which a distinction is made between the highlands and the coast, the author assumes the search for the true Peru among the Indians or, likewise, in the Peruvian highlands. However, Peru cannot be free and civilized until the Indians are rescued from the barbarism in which they are submerged:

Three hundred years ago, the Indian was crawling in the lower strata of civilization, being a hybrid with the vices of the barbarian and without the virtues of the European: teach him even to read and write, and you will see if in a quarter of a century he rises or not to the dignity of man. It is up to you, schoolteachers, to galvanize a race that is falling asleep under the stultifying tyranny of the Indian (González, 1985, p. 46).

Although the education of the indigenous people, which have been kept in ignorance without even being able to read or write, is missing, the claim for the Indian has

as a background the constitution of Peruvian society. His idea is that the indigenous race is part of the broad mestizo society, in the words of Gonzalez Prada: "Also the mestizos of the coast remember having in our veins the blood of the subjects of Philip II mixed with the blood of the subjects of Huayna Capac. Our spine tends to lean" (González, 1985, p. 44). The problem, finally, is a mestizo problem and, therefore, a Peruvian problem.

With this in mind, Clorinda Matto's starting point is the barbarism of the Indian. The logic of civilization and barbarism is maintained, establishing the need to educate the Indian in order to get him out of the misery and slavery in which he lives. However, she emphasizes the role played here by non-indigenous subjects who are to blame for the immobility of the Indians. The legal and religious system, inherited from colonial times, is the main culprit for keeping the Indian -understood as a victim- in misery.

Clorinda Matto's educational structure seeks the development of the entire nation, however, the predominant perspective in her work is the extraction of the subjects from the Killac to go and be educated in the civilized center of national life: Lima. Unlike what happens in Mariluán, the education of the indigenous can only take place in civilized spaces, since in towns like the Kíllac the young people are spoiled. It is striking that the dispute between civilization and barbarism acquires in the case of the Indian an idea that for Blest Gana is already destined to failure: the extraction of the subject to civilized spaces and that, through the friction with the people of the capital can assume a moral behavior different from the one he then carries. In fact, for the narrator, the Indian is doomed to disappear as long as the structures of domination to which he has been subjected are not overcome, a law based on the exploitation and subjugation of the Indians:

Oh! pray to God that one day, exercising his goodness, he may decree the extinction of the indigenous race, which after having flaunted imperial greatness, drinks the mud of opprobrium. Pray to God for its extinction, since it is not possible for it to recover its dignity, nor exercise its rights! (Matto, 1994, p. 10).

The only hope left to the indigenous is disappearance, that is why the novel is understood more as a conflict between different groups that will have miscegenation as their future. In *Aves sin nido* the dichotomy of civilization and barbarism does not develop

between the white subjects and the indigenous, but between the progressive foreigners and the conservative inhabitants of the Killac. The indigenous have no real part in the actions except to receive injustice, that is, they have no agency within the actions of the novel that are developed by the non-indigenous subjects. In this sense, the problem of the nation is delimited by the progressivism of the coast and the burden of the conservative institutions that keep the Peruvian people in misery:

We believe that what is happening in *Killac*, as in all the small towns of the interior of Peru, is only a variant of that savagery, where *the lack of schools*, the lack of good faith in the parish priests, and the manifest depravity of the few who trade with the ignorance and the following submission of the masses, move, every day more, those towns away from the true civilization that, cemented, would add to the country important sections with elements tending towards its greater aggrandizement (Matto, 1994, pp. 25-26, my italics).

School is one of the necessary spaces for the development of true civilization, which is already present in Lima and other cities of the country. The true civilization confronted those false civilized people who subjugate the Indians and establish tradition as a mandate. The search for communion between tradition and progress is developed as a utopian motif throughout the novel, being the main space for Peru's progress. The communication between the coast and the highlands will be the opportunity to modernize the nation, however, such modernization must take place with national roots. A clear example is the description of the railroad: "Suddenly snort of the locomotive can be heard, which with its whistle announces the progress brought by the rails to the thresholds where Manco Capac stopped" (Matto, 1994, p. 141).

The idea of the regeneration of the indigenous is constantly repeated in *Aves sin nido* in the voice of the Lima characters: "If someday the dawn of the true autonomy of the Indian were to dawn, we would witness the regenerative evolution of a race today oppressed and humiliated" (Matto, 1994, p. 54); however, the education that is needed is Europeanized and acculturated:

Within the framework of the "possible consciousness" of the time, education could only be considered as a process that favored the realization of European ideals. As an effective

resource for the homogenization of the country, education not only did not foresee neither pluralisms nor contrasts but, on the contrary, openly condemned them. In *Aves sin nido*, in fact, “true civilization” is spoken of as a single system and education as a way to access its organizing principles. The “white” filiation of the *Yupanqui* girls implies not only adoption, then, but also education, although within the story this appears to be confused with the experience of the well-constituted home (Cornejo, 2011, p. 110).

In the novel, the careful education promised for the daughters of the *Yupanqui* couple meant the loss of their way of life. This is manifested in Marcela’s words: “It hurts my heart when I remember that she will no longer look at us as she does now, when Margarita is a child”. Despite Juan’s assurances that “Mrs. Lucía will teach her to respect us” (Matto, 1994, 43), Margarita’s inclusion in the Marín family implies that her education will eliminate her indigenous habitation, and it’s worth saying that she will be whitened. According to Lola Aponte (1994), the need to westernize the indigenous is worked in the novel both in the statement of the work and in the poetics that underlies the writing of it. The educational project will be motivated by the new Lima bourgeoisie “to face new labor and economic demands in order to consolidate its hegemony. The latter is outlined both in its poetics and in the development of the novel itself when explaining the advantages that the *Yupanqui* daughters will have for having entered the bosom of a Creole family, which will educate them in their worldview” (Aponte, 1994, 48).

The trip to Lima means for the *Yupanqui* sisters the loss of their roots and a new birth, which is literally described when the train derails: “Truly, we have been born again; poor daughters of mine! -said Lucia” (Matto, 1994, p. 153). The transition to the new life evidenced the break with *Killac* and with the indigenous customs. The rupture is so evident that we can understand the incest in which Manuel and Margarita would have incurred as the necessary break for a new beginning. On the other hand, the *Yupanqui* embody the conflict between the Peruvian highlands and the coast, leaving the coastal cities as a symbol of education and progress, while the highlands and inland towns, such as *Killac*, will be seen as the remnants of barbarism. While in Lima “the heart is educated and the intelligence is instructed” (Matto, 1994, p. 79), and “to travel to Lima is to arrive at the

anteroom of heaven, and to see there the throne of Glory and Fortune. They say that our beautiful capital is the city of the Fairies" (Matto, 1994, p. 80); Killac will be 'a barbarous town' (Matto, 1994, p. 49), where 'a young man [...] is spoiled' (Matto, 1994, p. 33).

Barbarism is imposed by those "others" who defend tradition, becoming "blind conservatives of their vitiated customs" (Matto, 1994, p. 65). With this, the struggle between civilization and barbarism will leave the Indians as good savages, in a relationship in which they are victims of the conservatives: "I know that when the unhappy Peruvian Indian does something bad, it is forced by oppression, desperate because of the abuses..." (Matto, 1994, p. 140). Abuses to which the enlightened subjects cannot remain oblivious: "The heart must despair before the oppression that [the indigenous] endure from the priest and the cacique!" (Matto, 1994, p. 115). All in all, the work leaves little room for the salvation of the indigenous in general and there remains only the salvation of individuals who can be rescued from the people.

Margarita and Rosalía Yupanqui are the only indigenous characters who leave Killac to become adopted daughters of the Marín couple, but in Margarita's case this departure is marked by the unveiling of the secret of her origin and, therefore, her identity is transformed into that of a mestizo.

The idea of miscegenation is presented in the novel as a sin of origin, since Margarita's real father is Bishop Claro. Because of this sin, the promise of the future that existed for Killac -the love of Margarita and Manuel-, cannot be fulfilled. Margarita builds an identity based on family unity that leaves in the past any union with the village of Killac and with her former racial condition. The overcoming of this past is represented in the Marín marriage.

The representation of the other, then, is divided: the indigenous other appears as 'innocent', "of charming customs for its simplicity" and the oppressive 'others', defined as 'ignorant', 'violent', 'lewd', 'dirty', 'drunks', "greedy". The identification with the oppressed 'other' and the condemnatory distance towards the oppressor 'other' opens a space of legitimacy to the social reformer (Mattalía, n/d).

The position assumed by the Limeños in the narrative is notable: they are not part of the indigenous people, but neither are they part of the oppressor group. In this sense, the existence of Kíllac is external to life in Lima and, therefore, the text becomes a denunciation of a distant reality, but one that must be changed through the unity of the Peruvian people, understood in the homogenization that *mestizaje* signifies. The point is important for a Peru that lost the war against Chile, where the gaze of the intellectuals of the time turns to the indigenous as the way to regenerate identity and national strength.

The novel insists on the division between civilization and barbarism, the former represented by the illustrated -Manuel and the Marín spouses-, while barbarism is defined by the entire village of Kíllac and the “terrifying trinity that embodied a single injustice” represented by “the priest Pascual, the governor and the collector or *cacique*” (Matto, 1994, p. 43). In this condition, *mestizaje* will mean the overcoming of difference and, therefore, of the struggle with the barbarism that keeps the indigenous people oppressed:

The idea of nation is then definitely marked by *mestizaje*; and *mestizaje* functions both as an emblem of internal synthesis, insofar as the mestizo is by his own condition living proof of that synthesis, and as an instance that, being intermediate between the Creoles and the Indians, also produces the same effect of convergence: it is the space of homogeneity and harmony, the model of a nation that has to bring together its disparate components into a coherent, compact and representative whole (Cornejo, 2011, p. 115).

The entry of the Limeños to the indigenous people means the entry of a civilizing mission that will be rejected because it's foreign. The final events will be lapidary for the intentions of the protagonists. In *Aves sin nido* the manifestation of the civilizing project is recognizable, above all, in the figure of young Manuel who, when asked if he would have the strength to oppose the abuse that tradition has meant for the people of Kíllac, answers: “That, precisely, is the struggle of the Peruvian youth exiled in these regions. I have the hope, Don Fernando, that the civilization that is pursued, waving the flag of pure Christianity, will soon manifest itself in the happiness of the family, and as a logical consequence, social happiness” (Matto, 1994, p. 63).

On the other hand, we must not forget the role that women play in the work and the importance they have for the development of society. In *Aves sin nido* there is a discourse on the need to value the role of women in society regarding, among other things, their role in education. Lucia becomes the example of virtue that the Yupanqui sisters must follow in their formation as good mothers and wives (Rebaza, n/d), thus, the logic is maintained, within the same family space, of the friction with civilized society that will lead to the development of indigenous girls towards the higher stages of civilization.

Final words

In all the territories of Latin America during the nineteenth century, the need to include both the indigenous people and their territories within the national society was understood for different reasons. On the one hand, it was necessary to expand the cultivation areas in order to respond to the growing export demand; while, on the other hand, homogenization and the search for the cultural and racial unity of the nation were required.

Regarding the first point, the civilizing idea has, as a background, the expansion of national markets. New labor is required, at the same time as the process that Lienhard (1990) has called “the second conquest” is carried out. The landowning advance to take over the territories seeks to expand the cultivation base for export, mainly to Europe and the United States. According to José Bengoa (2008, p. 157), in the Chilean case, the growth of the agro-export market required an increase in the country’s production capacity, while the only unexploited lands were those in the indigenous territories. This condition meant the need to definitively annex the territories south of the Bío-Bío.

Regarding the second point, the governing strata of Latin American societies consider that the existence of indigenous peoples as alien and autonomous territories goes against the project defined since the independence periods. They demand that society be unique and indivisible and, therefore, the assimilation and civilization of the popular and indigenous spaces is necessary in order to advance towards development:

The ideological foundation for all these offensives against the most autonomous sectors is social Darwinism with its demand to “put an end to backwardness”, to modernize the country, to Europeanize it in all areas, including that of “race”; indigenous or popular

autonomies are, of course, the worst obstacle to the realization of this policy (Lienhard, 1990, p. 115).

Based on the above, education stands as one more in a series of processes integrating otherness into the national reality that, ultimately, include violent assimilation. Throughout Latin America, the inclusion of indigenous peoples into society was sought in one way or another, which implied the total abandonment of their customs and ways of life considered barbaric. This situation becomes evident in the analysis of the works in progress. The demarcation of a frontier that divides civilization from barbarism tensions the national project by making explicit the need to assimilate the indigenous. The strategies used by both authors are based on the fact that the formation of the other will promote the development of society as a whole, which is in crisis due to internal conflicts caused by the difference. It is striking that the solution to this crisis, proposed by education, is found at different times in the space of each novel.

In Alberto Blest Gana's work, different formative structures for the inclusion of the indigenous are visualized: the school and the army, these structures are complementary. On the other hand, the failure of the Mariluán project will also mean the failure of a decentralized educational strategy, which sought the isolated education of some indigenous people. This is in line with the discussions on the progress of schooling at the time: as long as the indigenous people are not concentrated in cities, their education will be impossible.

In Clorinda Matto's text, the educational problem is constructed around other major conflicts that leave the indigenous without capacity for action. The strategy of the work, which understands the liberation of the indigenous as impossible, has as its center the passage towards the *mestizo* as the foundation of the national reality. Thus, if in Mariluán there is evidence of the failure of an educational strategy that sought a centralized education in Santiago of the indigenous subjects who would return to their territory being the architects of the modernization of the Buthalmapu; in the case of *Aves sin nido* it is precisely that model that is attempted in the Yupanqui sisters, however, as it progresses, only the uprooting and the definitive rupture with their roots remain.

Bibliographic references

- Anderson, B. (2016). *Comunidades imaginadas. Reflexiones sobre el origen y la difusión del nacionalismo*. Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Aponte, L. (1994). "Aves sin nido o la novela como fotografía de estereotipo". *Letras femeninas*, 20(1-2), 45-57.
- Barraza, E. (2013). *Adelantados y escritura de la conquista. Imaginarios historiográficos en la literatura chilena*. USACH.
- Bengoa, J. (2008). *Historia del pueblo mapuche. Siglos XIX y XX*. LOM.
- Blest, A. (1949). *Mariluán. Un drama en el campo*. Zig-Zag.
- Blest, A. (1977). "Literatura chilena. Algunas consideraciones sobre ella". En J. Promis, *Testimonios y documentos de la literatura chilena (1842-1975)*. Nascimento.
- Cornejo, A. (2011). *Escribir en el aire. Ensayo sobre la heterogeneidad socio-cultural en las literaturas andinas*. Centro de Estudios Literarios Antonio Cornejo Polar.
- Coronil, F. (1999). "Más allá del Occidentalismo: hacia categorías geohistóricas no imperiales". *Revista Casa de las Américas*, 214, 22-45.
- Egaña, M. (2000). *La educación primaria popular en el siglo XIX en Chile: una práctica de política estatal*. DIBAM.
- González, B. (1996). "Economías fundacionales. Diseño del cuerpo ciudadano". En B. González (Comp.), *Cultura y tercer mundo. 2. Nuevas identidades y ciudadanías* (pp. 17-47), Nueva Sociedad.
- González, M. (1985). *Páginas libres. Horas de lucha*. Biblioteca Ayacucho.
- Kaempfer, Á. (2006). "Alencar, Blest Gana y Galván: narrativas de exterminio y subalternidad". *Revista Chilena de Literatura*, 69, 89-106.
- Lander, E. (2016). "Ciencias sociales: saberes coloniales y eurocéntricos". E. Lander (Comp.), *La colonialidad del saber: eurocentrismo y ciencias sociales. Perspectivas latinoamericanas* (pp. 15-44). Ciccus / CLACSO.
- Láscar, A. (2003). "Mariluán y el problema de la inserción del mundo indígena al Estado Nacional. Expansión del Estado Nación y rearticulación simbólica del cuerpo indígena". Working paper series. Ñuke Mapuförlaget, 16.

- Lienhard, M. (1990). *La voz y su huella. Escritura y conflicto étnico-social en América Latina (1492-1988)*. Casa de las Américas.
- Mattalía, S. (s/f). "La representación del 'otro': Aves sin nido de Clorinda Matto de Turner". Cervantes virtual: http://www.cervantesvirtual.com/obra-visor/la-representaciondel-otro-aves-sin-nido-de-clorinda-matto-de-turner/html/99cc55e2-38co-41dab1e3-2dc4b88o48oc_3.html#l_o
- Matto de Turner, C. (1994). *Aves sin nido*. Biblioteca Ayacucho.
- Moraña, M. (2014). "La nación y el altar de la patria: América Latina en los imaginarios del siglo XIX". En *Inscripciones críticas. Ensayos sobre cultura latinoamericana* (pp. 53-79). Cuarto Propio.
- Portugal, A. (s/f). "El periodismo militante de Clorinda Matto de Turner". Cervantes virtual: https://www.cervantesvirtual.com/obra-visor/el-periodismo-militante-declorinda-matto-de-turner/html/f4e5ee39-77d4-447d-a5a9-09o2762b8a26_5.html
- Rebaza, M. (s/f). "La educación de la mujer en la obra *Aves sin nido*". Cervantes virtual: http://www.cervantesvirtual.com/obra-visor/la-educacion-de-la-mujer-en-la-obraaves-sin-nido--o/html/75acf663-389d-47dd-a4o8-df7691d414af_2.html
- Reyes, A. (1980). "El deslinde. Apuntes para la teoría literaria". *Obras completas de Alfonso Reyes XV*. Fondo de Cultura Económica.
- Serrano, S. (1995-1996). "De escuelas indígenas sin pueblos a pueblos sin escuelas indígenas: la educación en la Araucanía en el siglo XIX". *Historia*, 29, 423-474.
- Triviños, G. (2006). "Mariluán de Alberto Blest Gana: panóptico, utopía, alteridad". En M. Rodríguez y G. Triviños (Eds.), *Utopía y mentira de la novela panóptica* (pp. 49-75). Universidad de Concepción.
- Troncoso, X. (2003). "Mariluán: Lautaro en la encrucijada". *Anales de Literatura Chilena*, 4, 59-72.
- Viveros, M. (2016). "Blanqueamiento social, nación y moralidad en América Latina". En S. Messeder, M. García y L. Moutinho (Org.). *Enlaçando sexualidades: uma tessitura interdisciplinar no reino das sexualidades e das relações de gênero* (pp. 17-39) Editora da Universidade Federal da Bahia.

PABLO HURTADO RUIZ

Chilean. Has a PhD in American Studies from the Institute of Advanced Studies of the University of *Santiago de Chile* (IDEA-USACH). Academic at the University of *Santiago de Chile*. Lines of research: colonial letters, formation of national states. Recent publications: Co-author in "*Las Memorias de Túpac Amaru y la autobiografía de Manzano en el proyecto nacional criollo*" (2020) and in "*Facundo, el folletín en el progreso (mayo-junio, 1845) de Domingo Faustino Sarmiento*" (2020).